Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION

This is a study based upon the relationship of Art, Economy and its economic impact. It may seem like an odd combination at first, must not the creative arts be free from the economic constraints? Isn’t economics the realms of rigorous commercial exchange? According to the cultural needs of the 21\textsuperscript{st} century, this research will show these two actually need each other; the role of creative economy merits discussion. This research contests that without a sound economic base art cannot exist and without creativity, the economy cannot flourish. The term ‘Economy’ means ‘the process or system by which goods and services are produced, sold, and bought in a country or region’,\textsuperscript{1} whereas the term ‘Art’ refers to ‘something that is created with imagination and skill and that is beautiful or that expresses important ideas or feelings’\textsuperscript{2} they are considered two separate entities. Through this research, I intend to show the association of the two genres. Art is not created for the sole purpose of selling; there is difference between the aesthetic value of art and the adding of monetary value. It is not only important for the elite of a particular area, but also for the economy; therefore, for the entire country. It serves a greater purpose than just making money. Nevertheless, the creative class has phenomenally contributed and still continues to do so, to the economy globally; evidence will be presented in the later part of my research. Furthermore, another perspective could be as to how the artist conducts business. In economics, the main factors of production are land, labour, capital and enterprise; at the same time, an artist is also working with these factors of production

\textsuperscript{1} Merriam Webster, http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/economy.[Last accessed: 1st November 2013].

a) Land: How the artist intends on utilising space, land for creating a visual art piece for e.g. a better elaboration could be site specific artworks,
b) Labour: In what ways the artist is utilizing his skill, or in some cases actually hiring people to work for him,
c) Capital: Nothing is for free. Money is always involved in everything, and either the purchase of medium, government funding or selling of the art piece, there is always a monetary value attached.
d) Enterprise: A platform where all the other factors are combined to create a visual piece and presented on another platform for display. For example, gallery, museums so on and so forth.

There is not much difference, the artist creates a piece of art and then depending on its purpose is most likely to sell the visual piece. Therefore, my research will focus on to what extent art is contributing to the economy in Pakistan. In terms of art, I will be discussing the field of Fine Arts and how it is also contributing to other creative fields, such as film, design, architecture and other grounds. It will be an in-depth study of the art market from the buying and selling of art works, job opportunities for artists; the role of art collectors and art entrepreneurs. The dissertation inculcates a literature review, which seeks to understand the wider perspective of the creative economy. Furthermore, the findings and the analysis of the data focus on Fine Arts particularly.

The initial idea of the dissertation focused on finding out state funding and its impact on art economy in Pakistan. There are a few cultural festivals along with a handful of art schools such as National College of Arts, Beaconhouse National University, Karachi University and others, as well as some institutes such as National Gallery of
Arts and Arts Council within Pakistan. However, overall, the state of Pakistan has not done much, which promotes this field of study particularly.

If one is to trace the historical conception and flourishing of different art forms, then during the early days of Pakistan, art, music and theatre were very much active and appreciated. However, during the fundamental Islamic period of Zia-ul-Haq, along with his Islamization policy in 1978, the role of arts was undermined. There was a brutal shut down. ‘Zia’s men drew up lists of artists. Fine arts, the performing arts were clamped down on.’\(^3\) His leadership went on for a decade during which most creative practices ceased to exist; limitations were added to arts, which is inherently a field of freedom. There was a severe collapse and the lives of artists were affected.

However, Musharaf’s liberalism policy led to the flourishing of the field, which was so deeply in decline. The National Gallery of Arts was opened after a long time the state showed interest towards arts. With the slow progression for arts, my interest increased to discover the participation of the state in the promotion of this field. However, another perspective to look at this is how ‘the shift in the environment provides an opportunity for the artist to comment reflect it through their work.’\(^4\) Over the period of time and the manipulation of the environment led our artists to create some major works of art; many of them, which have gotten international recognition.

During the research for the dissertation, it dawned upon me that the topic was divided into two sub-categories– a) state funding or investment and its return to the government. b) Art economy; this is when I realized I had an innate interest in art


economy as a separate entity. Questions such as the fact that whether art plays a bigger role or whether the government can wipe it off so easily continued to run through my mind.

In fact, my choice for opting for Fine Arts as my majors during the course of my undergraduate has always been questioned by numerous individuals in a pessimistic way; people continue to ask whether the field will actually be able to provide benefit to me in the future considering the deplorable conditions of the country that we live. However, it needs to be realized that previously the role of art had not been recognized as important enough to actually merit serious consideration and something that actually brought monetary gain. Therefore, my interest in the topic sparked when I gradually found out that art does not only remain a form of creative expression. In fact, it is a major contributor to the corporate sector; a field within arts which has been highly neglected and often misunderstood. There is little research available in Pakistan with the perspective of Fine Arts and creative economy; therefore my research in some ways will be quite broad.

This can be better described with an example from UK: ‘The creative industries are straight forwardly, unequivocally, vital to our economy. 6.2% of the UK’s local income (GVA) comes from the creative industries, the arts provide over 2m jobs and are mentioned by 8 out of 10 tourists as a reason for their visit […] Not only do the arts contribute massively to the UK economy, funding the arts only costs everyone in Britain 17p per week.’

In general, it has always been my interest to explore as to why art is not considered an important field within our country. Why is it that art does not get the recognition and

---

importance that it deserves? Creative economies experience a massive rate of growth; some of them are highly lucrative. However, most of the research is confined to developed countries. None of them explore the importance of creative economy within developing nations like Pakistan. Our society has a bias ignorance towards art. The capitalist nature of the world demands research into this field; how is that art can contribute to the economy so that it gets the attention that it is worthy of? For this purpose, during the course of my dissertation, I spoke to art entrepreneurs, curators, educationalists, artists, economists that can understand creative economy who understand its role within Pakistan and governmental officials, such as Asma Ibrahim, Sameen Raja and Noor Jehan Bilgrami.

The support for my thesis can be established in the words of Art Commissioner Linda Langston from USA states 'we in the public sector need to keep in mind what an important role the arts play in economic development. Part of a community’s vibrancy is defined by its arts and culture quality and diversity. All the things we do at county level to support the arts can make a difference, and I encourage county officials to step up to make sure their communities understand the linkage between local economic development and the arts.\(^6\)

---

Chapter 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

This section sought to understand the relationship between art and economy, the extent to which the two fields support each other, and their importance. For this purpose, books, articles and a number of journals were analysed.

2.1: Art Education

It is essential to understand the significance and the relationship of art. The support for this argument can be found within the text: *Arts education and the Innovation economy by John M. Eger*. Art education plays an essential role for this field. However, what are the reasons behind it? If there were no arts education, people were taught how to teach arts then how will a society create its artists? If not create, then who will guide their craftsmanship?

Art education means art schools that further work towards producing artist, which goes on towards creative techniques and innovation; a very obvious cycle of production. These are the two key elements in Eger’s theory.

Eger elaborates about the importance of creativity as it ignites innovation, the two hallmarks of the most successful economies in the 21st century. He further explores that the United States of America is no longer considered the only world leader of technology, the manufacturing and tertiary industry. These sectors are now globally recognised and other countries have taken over them, resulting in a strong competition. In order to progress, it is important that communities bring innovation, which is inherently possible through creativity. People need to study art since it seeks to broaden their imagination and bring out the innovative creativity. Eger states, ‘We have lost our dominance in manufacturing, as well as in the provision of services like
banking, accounting and insurance. Computers and Internet access can be found almost everywhere in the world, and most countries can provide such services anywhere, anytime and usually at a fraction of what it costs in the U.S. 

He further elaborates and highlights the perception of art as to how earlier it was considered as a luxury for the elite, ‘arts are nice but not necessary’ but now the perception and ideology behind it has changed. It’s not a matter of want but in fact a matter of need. The key element of art i.e. creativity and innovation has taken its own form in boosting all other fields

In general, Eger discusses that due to global competition people with college degrees and diploma are of no use until they bring in innovation, new ideas to reinvent the economy and this is only possible through arts education. By pointing out creativity and innovation the two key aspects in his research, Eger explains the importance for arts and its possible outcomes.

This piece of writing is helpful for my research since through highlighting the importance of arts education, it is able to illustrate how it will generate thinking skills in young minds that further help the economy to grow in the longer run. Secondly, he talks about the importance of art schools and colleges which means new schools and arts for the education of arts; hence, opening employment opportunities for working and the service class and thus generating income, revenue, better standard of living, educating the public and creating productive minds that will further benefit the economy. It is; therefore, a cycle which keeps the economy moving. Apart from this, when we talk about creativity and innovation and its demand worldwide; for example miniature, traditional crafts and techniques are appreciated worldwide for their unique

---

identity; thus creating employment opportunities for artists and craftsman here. The demand generates the supply.

2.2: Creativity and Economy

My second reading The Rise of the Creative Class by Richard Florida was an attractive read where Florida highlights the importance of the word ‘creative’. He speaks about how every human being is creative and the word itself is the most commonly used word in the social media. He describes the Creative Class to be the most dominant class in the US. However, he includes engineers, scientists, artists and all other professions that involve any form of creativity under the category of the creative class. However, scientists would not be within the topic of my research because for the purpose of this dissertation, the creative class includes artists. But what makes my research relevant is the benefit of how overall the creative class is benefitting the economy. For instance, designers, architects and different kinds of artists are working in collaboration with all other fields. Florida talks about how creativity leads to more productivity and a more satisfying career field. When the great economic fall of 2008 happened the creative class proved to be successful and was able to survive. The unemployment rates were higher in the Working, Service and the Agricultural class but the Creative class was more dominating ‘As the Working Class shrank, the Creative Class expanded. Between 2001 and 2010, the creative Class grew by 2.8 million workers, or 7.2 percent, expanding from 38.7 million to 41.4 million members.’

Florida highlights the benefits of being a member of creative class since it promotes diversity and tolerance; a place where all the creative members would want to live.

---

where economic growth was taking place. Secondly, due to the acceptable, user-friendly and satisfying environments of the creative class, other institutions such as business and law firms are adapting creative methods since creativity and productivity go together. He states, ‘a good idea offers not a diminishing returns but an increasing returns’. We can conclude that through choosing creative field, one can gain a satisfying standard of living, which leads to a more satisfying and productive environment to work in. A healthy physical and social environment is essential for creativity, a point that is very debatable for an artist living in unstable conditions of Pakistan, but this is what that makes it even more interesting. With so many problems faced in this country, creative methods can actually be used in the improvement of such conditions.

However, it also merits discussion whether Pakistan can create such creative cities. *Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modelling approach with Preliminary Application to Karachi by Ammar A. Malik, Andrew T. Crooks and Hilton L. Root* is a case study done in 2013. This study can be very well related to Florida’s theories as it speaks about how creativity and innovation has been a key prosperity factor in the world’s leading cities. ‘They’re the best for work and play’ This study highlights the problems and potentials of Karachi; the 11th largest city in the world. It is easier to relate to theories when they’re first hand, likewise when talking about our city and its economical, environmental and social constraints and their impacts; it bridges the developing and developed gaps.

---

11 Ammar A. Malik, Andrew T. Crooks, Hilton L. Root, ‘Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modeling approach with preliminary application to Karachi’, Pakistan strategy Support program, 2013 p6 (case study)
‘Forbes magazine has termed Karachi the ‘the world’s fastest growing megacity’ with 80 percent growth in a decade.’\textsuperscript{12} A city with a tremendous growth rate faces incredible amount of divisions within that, which restricts its economic prosperity. However, it still remains Pakistan’s strongest economical hub. But creative and innovative techniques remain mandatory for further growth. Parks, art galleries and museums are the key locations in the world for human connectivity, but with the prevailing conditions in Karachi, the city lacks in promotion and creation of such units. ‘Paradigm of urban growth fosters greater with human interaction which is the key function of the cities (Jacob, 1961)’\textsuperscript{13}

Human interaction proves to be a fundamental growth factor that is only possible where there are attractions for the general public, hence, creativity and its unique identity remains essential.

Moving on, the secondary benefits of the cultural economy are better explained in \textit{The Warhol Economy} by Elizabeth Currid. Currid describes the popular culture in New York and how youth is influenced by fashion, art and music to the extent that they tend to make it their lifestyle. ‘Entertainment- whether Fashion week or the MTV Music Awards show generates lots of money, and if we think a little probably lots of jobs.’\textsuperscript{14}

Currid describes the inspiring richness of art and culture in New York as the global centre, attracting writer’s musicians, bohemians, artists, and dancers all across the

\textsuperscript{12}Ammar A. Malik, Andrew T. Crooks, Hilton L. Root, ‘Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modeling approach with preliminary application to Karachi’, Pakistan strategy Support program, 2013 p7 (case study)

\textsuperscript{13}Ammar A. Malik, Andrew T. Crooks, Hilton L. Root, ‘Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modeling approach with preliminary application to Karachi’, Pakistan strategy Support program, 2013 p9 (case study)

globe. It is a place that celebrates and accepts diversity. However, she also highlights the role of cultural economy; where the economy is manipulated by the culture. Manipulating the demand playing with the minds of its consumers, experts, writer’s curators are the ‘tastemakers’ or ‘gatekeepers’ who play a special role in shaping the economy, their comments ‘has the credibility to crown a dress, a painting, or a new music single with the approval and the cachet that make it worth wearing, buying or listening to.’\textsuperscript{15} They decide the trends, the glamorous high profiles exhibitions or record launch. These high profile social gatherings attracts the buyers, for instance Andy Warhol’s pop art prints of Marylin Monroe were famous as art, media, fashion. Hence, a correlation can be found. But her findings describe the cultural economy of New York; likewise Pakistan is also culturally very strong. Our weddings, and norms, religious celebrations are thoroughly celebrated. However, the important question is to whether these are promoting to the art economy? Artist Sumaiya Jilani painted a desi version of Marylin Monroe, a collision of pop art with our culture. Her work was very much appreciated that further turned into prints on clothes, covers along with other mediums. Secondly designers and architects in Pakistan have also started to collaborate with fine artists for a new perspective. Hence, Art not only has first hand benefits but also second hand advantages.

‘How the Arts Contribute to the Economy’ also substantiates my argument. The article is a study of UK’s art market and its contribution towards the economy. It specifically highlights the importance of cultural and art industries and their support in increasing the economic activity.

‘According to UNESCO the UK is the world’s largest exporter of cultural goods. Now there’s something. When have we been the world’s largest exporter of anything recently? And this is achieved with a taxpayer investment, which is 0.1 percent of the recent HBOS bailout. Not only that, with this tax payer investment we generate more economic activity than tourism, and we do this without a bonus culture, and without a ‘talent drain’ – Talking Birds in 2008’

Here, they discuss, the government does not face any form of loss, whilst investing in art and culture. In fact, it is able to benefit both the parties.

An example as to how fine arts provides over 2 million jobs in the UK and not only that but 8 out of 10 tourist sites are about arts was discussed previously, as well. Hence, art not only promotes itself but it is an active contributor to other fields such as tourism, employment and economy that also in a substantial amount. This article also shows a graph where it shows the outcome of the arts. It’s much more than the investment all together from private and public sector.


Therefore, through these statistics it can be concluded as to how art is a profitable revenue generator, and for this purpose, artists are also encouraged in creating art, with a generous amount of investment. This leads to the production of more art pieces without any kind of constraints. In addition, it shows that there is a separate form of public funding. When a government subsidises a form of production, the cost goes down thus making art affordable appreciated for all classes. It does not conform to a certain group. When talking about art, they do not mean just fine artist but other creative fields as well as has been described.

Charlotte Higgins puts it brilliantly in this article where she explains how the subsidised arts sector feeds the flagship successes like the National Theatre and Royal Opera House, and Nicholas Hytner (artistic director of the former) suggests that where the UK otherwise falls down, ‘It is our creative economy that is genuinely still a world-beater, and at its centre is the network of publicly subsidised institutions that are its engine room’ .

This article supports the fact how art is major contributor economy and other creative fields, which makes it relevant to my dissertation, where I can study art and its return to our economy in Pakistan and how it can prove to be beneficial in the long run.

Another case study of the USA that elaborates the statistical scenario is Arts and Economic Prosperity III, The Arts Mean Business by ROBERT L. LYNCH, PRESIDENT AND CEO, ‘AMERICANS FOR THE ARTS’. This is a case study of America’s national report, which analyses The Economic Impact of Nonprofit Arts and Culture Organizations and Their Audiences.

‘The key lesson from Arts & Economic Prosperity III is that communities that invest

---

in the arts reap the additional benefits of jobs, economic growth, and a quality of life that positions those communities to compete in our 21st century creative economy. In my travels across the country, business and government leaders often talk to me about the challenges of funding the arts and other community needs amid shrinking resources. They worry about jobs and the economic performance of their community. [...] The findings from Arts & Economic Prosperity III send a clear and welcome message: leaders who care about community and economic development can feel good about choosing to invest in the arts.

It starts off with a very optimistic approach for those who are interested in investing in the arts; it states how art is good for the economy, the culture, the community, for jobs and a high standard of living. The study looks at art from a wider perspective. The previous article discussed art market within the UK, whereas the second discusses the top creators of art and creative industries within the USA. The analysis of the American market is such ‘by every measure, the results are impressive! Nationally, the nonprofit arts and culture industry generates $166.2 billion in economic activity annually—a 24 percent increase in just the past five years. That amount is greater than the Gross Domestic Product of most countries. This spending supports 5.7 million full-time jobs right here in the United States—an increase of 850,000 jobs since our 2002 study.

The statistics from both the articles can substantiate the claim that compared to other fields, art can fundamentally lead to more benefits for the economy. The investment and the revenue returned to the government can be easily termed as ‘rewarding’. For

---

instance in this study they point out the characteristics ‘our industry also generates nearly $30 billion in revenue to local, state, and federal governments every year. By comparison, the three levels of government collectively spend less than $4 billion annually to support arts and culture—a spectacular 7:1 return on investment that would even thrill Wall Street veterans.’

Hence with such a high ratio of profit it shows the art market is a booming sector of the USA economy.

Creativity is a form of innovation that ignites a thought; it is a way of communicating that is eye-catching and is directly understood and enjoyed by the viewer. There are first hand and second hand benefits. The first hand benefits could be creating art and selling it, running a gallery or a museum, the second hand benefits are for example: ‘When patrons attend a performing arts event, for example, they may park their car in a toll garage, purchase dinner at a restaurant, and eat dessert after the show. Valuable commerce is generated for local merchants. This study shows that the typical attendee spends $27.79 per person, per event, in addition to the cost of admission’

This keeps the economy moving, from buying to selling, there is an act of movement happening and with the involvement of art, it attracts large audiences. With large audiences comes a large cost of entry, the cost of transport, the cost of food, keeping the economy moving, benefitting other businesses and the general public – a level of satisfaction for all. However, the above-mentioned cost is just for a USA national. What about tourists? Art tends to attract large markets. ‘Nonlocal audiences spend

---

twice as much as their local counterparts ($40.19 vs. $19.53). Arts and culture are magnets for tourists, and tourism research repeatedly shows that cultural travelers stay longer and spend more.’

It can be easily concluded by analyzing both the studies how art has been a strong contributor to the economy that further benefits the country with such a successful turnout rate. This is not only the private but the public sector as well. It promotes other businesses attracts tourist that bring in twice as much money, increase the quality of life, which makes this wholly suitable for my dissertation. While studying the Pakistani art economy, the investment can be compared with the investment in the developed world and a thorough analysis of the two different markets.

But what about the monetary value of art? Does an art piece not have a price tag attached to it? ‘Economy: The art of finance —Harold James 2008’ looks at art from a rather different perspective for it discusses the monetary value of the art piece. What determines the value of a work of art and how should the investors judge the profitability of the art piece. The article establishes that art is a form of ‘store of value’. However, this article does argue as to what piece of art can be considered an investment and how the other cannot be an investment. ‘In order to be sure of the reliability of this function, the purchaser must be convinced of the long-term valuation of the object of desire’.

---

It mentions old and new pieces of art whose value has increased over time, but why? This article highlights how occurrences and the nature tend to mold the value of art. ‘A remarkable event occurred in London. While the City of London was shaken by the collapse of Lehman Brothers and the run on HBOS, Sotheby’s staged a record-breaking auction for the works of the artist Damien Hirst, which produced a gross, take of around $200 million. Compared to the values that were being destroyed on Wall Street, this was small change; but it was a remarkable vote of confidence in the work of one artist.’

The cost and the price of Hirst’s piece are poles apart but what truly marks the value of art? Is it a gamble? Or is it environment? Many artists in Pakistan gained recognition worldwide due to socio-political factors. For instance, Imran Qureshi gained recognition globally after commenting on the current state. Harold describes how financial bubbles worldwide inspire the art piece and then later another occurrence influences the price of the art itself. One of the examples is ‘Renaissance Florence depended on the patronage of the Medici. Sixteenth-century Venice turned the wealth of the spice trade into the canvases of Titian and Tintoretto.’

This article highlights the value of art and how it is influenced by events, what encourages collectors to invest or whether the choice is solely dependent on personal preference and taste of the collector? Perhaps it also depends on the art collectors. ‘From their viewpoint, collecting art was not simply a matter of benevolence or public

---

spiritedness. Nor was it simply a very expensive hobby. Their galleries showed in a visible and very public way the discernment and judgment that their financial business depended on.²⁸

Finance is a major aspect in art. A whole lot of a form of politics is involved in determining a value of art for instance ‘But there was also another motive driving the bidders. One hint was that Russian buyers paid the big money, at the very moment that Russia’s banking system was melting down. At the same time, there was a surge in demand for gold jewelry’ ²⁹

It is highly debatable as to who decides the value of art and the role of the art collectors along with the way the environment manipulates the value of art; a valuable point for my research. When the value of art increases, collectors also see this as a golden opportunity in investing for the arts for their own primary benefits.

‘Renewing Passports’ by Khaula Daris, covers the artist talks happened in the Islamabad Literature Festival 2014. It’s very interesting how artists like Jamal Shah, Risham Syed and Adeela Suleman talk about the current art scene in Pakistan. They speak about how Pakistan has a rich cultural history and how social political conflicts have given the artist an opportunity to rise internationally, supporting the previous literature by Harold Times. Another interesting conversation that Dar highlights is between gallery owner Sameera Raja and former politician and current board member of Mohatta Palace museum Sherry Rehman who talked about art and its culture within Pakistan. Where we talk about the liberation of arts, she talks about how the

conservative culture has proved to be beneficial in Pakistan for the promotion of creative thought in artists ‘since we haven’t been an ideally open society and art flourishes best in those. Zia appropriated art and culture but there was pathology of discontent that was speaking against the repression. Art become a disillusionment of democracy for the ones directly affected by it, as an act of political engagement. In the late 70s and 80s many creative flowers bloomed, theatre flourished, women groups emerged, cultural expression adapted a new language despite the heavy censorship of the state.’

A political opinion backs up my research how the state considers art. Their interest is highly essential for growth be it any field, especially when that growth is happening to the economy

It is important to highlight the economic benefits of art within Pakistan and the way that art can contribute to every aspect in the life of an individual. The review of the literature suggested the different statistics essential to my topic. Furthermore, it is significant to understand as to what moulds the Pakistani art scene and as to why it operates on such a conservative level?

---

Chapter 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This chapter will focus on the methods used to conduct my research. The main idea of my research is to find out to what extent Arts contribute to the economy in Pakistan. Where does the art market stand culturally and economically with respect to art?

The research methodology followed secondary data collection along with primary data collection. The secondary sources includes various published books and articles written by Richard Florida, John M Eger, Elizabeth Currid, Bruno S Frey, Art Now and Case studies, Daily Times, Koel Gallery, Canvas Gallery and other sites which offered a great deal of information with regards to the research.

During the course of the research process, I came across different theories or concepts by writers, which became an imperative part of this document. They are as follows:

- By Richard Florida, American writer. His theories speak of the Creative class and how it contributes to the economic society as a whole. His theories favour creativity and how it benefits the culture, economy and the society, making creative economy a very essential part of the 21st century. His theories help me look at western creative economy that makes it easy for me to compare it with the east. Thus, this highlights the issues that we lack behind within Pakistan.

- By Elizabeth Currid, professor/writer, who presents the view that marketing concept and artistic abilities do not gel in together because of the personal values and social norms, which have an impact on the artistic production process. She highlights how social events play a great role in promoting the arts. For example creative workers have the power to play with demands of the consumers; their input plays a great role. For instance when an outlet or an idea or a brand gets in trend, the consumers want to be all around it; they buy every article products related to these. These include merchandise such as
shirts coffee, glasses, and cups everything. It is all about what’s in fashion, it plays with demand and supply; an interesting yet an important aspect for economy.

- John M Eger, author and lecturer at San Diego State University was also explored within the course of this research. His theories speak of creativity and innovation, and how education in arts highly essential for economic development. Since this element ignites the sense of creativity it helps me look in ways as to how art education can help Pakistan.

Initiating the research was a tough call for me in the first few weeks because it was difficult to decide whom to interview in Pakistan, since Art market is still in its developing stage and combining it with economy seemed odd for the market. So first I started talking to people about my topic and made a list of people who I felt are relevant. While some responded, others were tough to get a hold of.

During the same time I started making the list of people that needed to be interviewed face-to-face. I e-mailed them and set an interview time, which was convenient for both the parties. However, there were some who I have been trying to contact for months like our cultural minister, so that I can get an opinion from both private and public parties. But I failed to get time off their busy schedule.

The questionnaire was devised based on the literature review research and was divided into five categories; educationalist, entrepreneurs, economists, Gallery Owners, and the Ministry of Arts and culture in Pakistan. These categories had different questions based on the specific field they belonged to.

I decided to carry out interviews and started this task on 2nd December, 2013 by contacting Sameera Raja, Curator at The Canvas Gallery, and other galleries such as Koel owners who were easily approachable.
The selection of the interviewees was done on the basis of each category, which had certain group specifics. In terms of art entrepreneurs, I managed to choose people who had certain knowledge of art and who are associated with hiring craftsmen and labour in their work and experience in the field of promotion. In terms of galleries, the criterion was based on being commercial as well as non-commercial galleries. The selection was from Canvas Gallery and Koel Gallery.

Moreover, these galleries have been in business for quite some time, which made it easier for me to understand how the art market system works in Pakistan. In addition to that, I also learnt that the galleries were established based on different school of thoughts, which gave me more room to dive deep into the ocean of art and its contribution.

I wanted to interview Sharmeela Faruqui, who is in charge of Ministry of Arts and Culture in Sindh. Her stance on this scenario would have offered me a great insight of the government and how they see art as a development in Pakistan. Why is the government funding or not funding the arts? Why did the Sindh festival had a separate day entirely devoted to arts? How does the government comprehend art as an imperative sector to our economy? But I failed to do so since she was extremely busy and was unable to take out time unfortunately. Her contribution to my dissertation would have gone a long way.

Lastly, I interviewed economists associated with the creative economy. A great deal of graduates ends up working for marketing fields. These economists have a better idea how the creative economy has evolved over the years. This was an interview that would support my study by Richard Florida.

I further visited, Arts council, events such as Pursukoon Karachi, Art Fest at Frere Hall for the Sindh Festival, National Art Gallery, NAPA, State Bank Museum and
Karachi museum, which are institutes that work for the purpose of promoting arts. These places were a great insight for my primary research where I was able to understand the governmental role and interest in the promotion of art.
Chapter 4: ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

I started conducting my interviews from November, in accordance to the events relevant for my research.

4.1: Private initiatives

For my primary research, I interviewed Sameera Raja. A well-known Art Entrepreneur - owner of private Canvas Gallery, someone who is associated with the art market. Hence, two interviews were conducted in order to get an in-depth insight as to how she feels as an entrepreneur the constraints and privileges of running a gallery. ‘For the past fourteen years Sameera Raja has been contributing to the development of Pakistani art in more ways than one. Her gallery in Karachi, the commercial and industrial capital of the country, focuses on the new art of Pakistan, especially by modern and contemporary artists.’

When it comes to art, there is an entire cycle of production, and this cycle contributes to the economy in such numerous ways, it not only gives employment to the artists but also people associated with other fields.

But when it comes to Pakistan, no statistics are available to prove that. Therefore, during the course of the interviews with Raja, I was able to gather interesting aspects of the Pakistani art scene and its influence.

Firstly, when asked as to what extent art is contributing to the economy, she began by explaining the very basic thorough cycle of production; firstly how it gives employment to the artist and contributes to their lifestyle. The second part of the cycle included those people who are actually investing within the country for the promotion

of arts. It is essential to remember that the investment of art is able to generate employment for artists, painters, canvas makers, materials suppliers and digital media printers. In addition, the work of the ‘karigar’ (craftsperson) is also important who further add up to either framing or finishing of the work. When the work is produced it is displayed in a gallery; another business entity that hires more people for the management of the event. During the process of exhibiting the work, the brochures are printed from a ‘printing wala’ (print store) and there’s also a photographer hired to document the work. Therefore, at the end of the day, it proves to be an on-going cycle. These are the direct effects of the promotion of art. The secondary benefits include how art biennales and workshops, exhibitions also invites artists from all over the world, thus promoting tourism that further benefit other business entities such as hotels along with long businesses. Her opinion can be well related with my Literature by Lynch, ‘Arts and economic Prosperity III’, from Arts Mean Business that highlights how in USA arts proves to be a constant contributor to the economy by stating “communities that invest in arts reap the additional benefits of jobs, economic growth, and a quality of life that positions those communities to compete in our 21st century creative economy.” Many people benefit such as, for example, Raja states ‘people like Adeela Suleman, Amin Gulgee, and Abdul Jabbar Gul – sculptors will be hiring apprentices’ so that’s also bringing an addition into system. However, this depends case to case, some may hire, and some may not- its medium incentive. It differs from professional to professionals.

Secondly, the interviewee spoke about the differences between the Pakistani market and the Western market, which is clearly more established and more developed. She

---

33 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10\textsuperscript{th} November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
spoke about how compared to that, the Pakistani market is simply a virgin; it is developing now, and where there are many potentials to the market, there are also many constraints and setbacks. This is because the basic level of awareness is missing; therefore, education is another challenge, which has to be dealt with. This is because what people previously know about art and art forms has changed rapidly, so therefore, awareness building is solely the responsibility of the private sector in today’s world keeping in view the Pakistani situation. ‘First it has to be education, basic art awareness and appreciation then it has be going from there about what is contemporary and conceptual art now in the 21st century’.

She also elaborated that there are numerous differences when it comes to Eastern and Western areas, since one area is developed while the other area is still developing. There is an art market within Pakistan but at this point in time, it is quite naive to use her term; some people don’t even know the core cause of its existence, and therefore by educating people it’s a first step towards making them aware of art. The art community is also quite small, which is another challenge in itself.

Further, during the interview, her opinion about public funding was also discussed with the role it plays in promoting arts, where Raja blatantly stated that, ‘when our government can’t provide us security how can they invest in art, they have enough issues on their part to deal with at the moment, art is least of their priorities, where private sector, multi nationals, philanthropist, financial institutions have to invest have to come in and work for its generation and existence.’ Therefore, it simply reflects that art is not a priority of the government and the private sector feels that, as well and does not rely on any kind of governmental support when it comes to monetary

---

34 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
35 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
assistance. However, Sameera as a private entrepreneur completely ignored the fact our Arts Councils of different provinces are partially funded by the government. The contributions of PNCA, the National Gallery of Arts in Islamabad, the NCA college that is subsidies by the government, how Sadequain was funded to paint the ceiling of Ferere Hall. Therefore, it can be assessed that the contribution exists, although it is quite minimal. Her negative stance towards the government somewhat shows the disillusionment she faces.

It was also discussed whether art can have other ways that it can be useful apart from the aesthetic appeal and the economic advantages since art can also be a medium of protest; known as rebellious art. She was able to voice that art simply is a form of beautification as well, and it is able to have a high aesthetic appeal ‘It’s about showing people what they don’t see ordinarily, something that leaves a mark on their memory.’

Moreover, it engages the viewer; it interacts with them in a special way, a form of visual communication like Amin Gulgee’s sculptures on roundabouts and Naiza Khans Henna Hands near the Cantt Station or Asim Butts Graffiti; even Banksy’s graffiti’s, they all create awareness, especially when they’re done on such a public level. ‘It makes you think; it gets you somewhere whether it’s emotionally, physically or spiritually. Whether inside a gallery space of outside it engages the viewer and this viewership is what you enforce, it is not always about the economics’

---

36 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]

37 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
More than the economic aspect of art, it contributes to even a larger picture; it creates awareness and appreciation. Sameera states: ‘it engages the viewer it brings people together and that’s the best art can do’.

With this form of creative dialogue of art that leaves an impression on viewer Raja talked more about awareness building, she was more inclined towards other benefits of art rather than just the economics. She spoke about economics but her leaning was more towards the creative aspect. She, as an entrepreneur has engaged into art for the creative aspect rather than merely the business aspect.

My second interview to get a wider perspective on Fine art and its contribution to the economy was with Noorjehan Bilgrami, owner of Koel gallery, artist, textile designer, one of the Founder of Indus Valley School of Art and Architecture and a researcher, someone who has been deeply associated with art. Her stance on this scenario was similar yet slightly different. Bilgrami has been working with the revival of block prints with an aesthetic of an artist. She started working for a ground where artist work in collaboration with craftsmen. ‘I opened a gallery opposite my house named ‘Maharat’; something that interests me, anyone with an excelling craft could display their work here. I wanted to encourage artist to work with craftsman and come up with different creations.’

She believes that ‘Culturally art has a lot of potential’ hence, her interest towards the cultural crafts and promoting Fine Artists and the Arts in Pakistan.

While Raja works, towards encouraging artist and building awareness, Bilgrami works towards both as well as encouraging craftsmen in this affair. It displays how

---

38 Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
39 NoorJehan Bilgrami Interviewed 31st May 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
40 NoorJehan Bilgrami Interviewed 31st May 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
Fine Arts broaden itself by associating with other fields. Especially when Bilgrami takes up ventures that involves other professionals as well, like Indus Valley School of Art and Architecture, Pursukoon Karachi, Koel, boutique café and gallery and currently she s working at another project at the Cantt Station with architects and designers. Thus telling us how as an artist one can also work towards building awareness, human interaction, thur creating jobe opportunities for everyone else, thus benefitting the economy.

4.2: Government initiatives

After the success of the Sindh Art Festival, I decided to interview Raja again. This project was an initiative of the Sindh government, with other multiple events at the Sindh Festival to promote our culture, Art fest being one of them. This event was an exhibition of contemporary and modern Art of Sindh on a public platform, at the Frere Hall. To host and manage this event, Raja was approached by the government for her prominence and dedication towards Fine Arts in the art world. And her first reaction to this proposal was ‘I don’t want anything to do with the government’ a typical reaction any private entrepreneur would’ve had for the kind of history they have with the government. The only reason she took up this project was the fact that finally when the government is taking an initiative, she didn’t want this opportunity to go waste or in the wrong hands; a risk yet an opportunity to spread awareness for art amongst the general public. Therefore, she collaborated with Adeela Suleman of Vasl and Fauzia Naqvi of Art Now to make this event successful. ‘This project was planned and executed within 6 weeks, with 65 contemporary artist who had any form of connection with Sindh were short listed; since Benazir Bhutto’s private art

41 Sameera Raja Interviewed 20th March 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
collection of the modern masters was on display so contemporary artists were shortlisted and were asked to display at this exhibition'.

The government commissioned all the Site-specific works, whereas the other works by the artists themselves were presented for display. Now the important subject is how this event was important for cultural economy. This can be proved through the fact that this display was viewed by 7000-8000 people from every walk of life, not just the people who belong in the art circle, giving employment, promoting artists, creating art and most importantly this supports Raja’s former idea of spreading awareness of art, which will further lead in making this matter an integral part of the economy in the future. Bilgrami also had a very healthy collaboration with the government for her ‘Pursukoon Karachi’s initiative, this event was also funded by the government, where numerous artist and designers and architects worked in collaboration to make this event successful, however this was a private sector initiative by the Koel Gallery and the best this event had done was again, bring together different professionals under one roof to work together for an exhibition that spread awareness amongst the public for the arts. Both these events were a building step towards promoting Fine Arts, where the public sector also took interest. Therefore it is plausible that the government is also now investing and promoting the arts.

Another person I decided to interview was Asma Ibrahim, a former curator at National Museum Karachi and current director at the State Bank Museum and the Sadequain Gallery. She is an archaeologist by profession but she has had an association with the government sector for a very long time. Our interview focused on

---

42 Sameera Raja Interviewed 20th March 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]
her experience with the creative economy, and to inquire her as to how the creative economy has flourished over the years. She was also asked the interest of the public in art displays within the museums. Furthermore, I also questioned her whether she felt any kind of difference when she was working for the government funded museums such as the State Bank Museum and then at the National Museum of Pakistan. First of all, she described how National Museum of Pakistan had issues functioning since the government contributed minimally in monetary terms to this field. There were issues maintaining the place whereas State Bank Museum has received numerous amounts of contributions because of its affiliation with the State Bank of Pakistan. She spoke that over there, the turnout was better because the students visited on a daily basis, which meant that the response at sometimes was a overwhelming; an interesting fact to consider that awareness for the arts is taking place and the interest also exists. She spoke as to how currently visitors were not allowed to visit for the time being due to contingent threats but otherwise there are a lot of visitors, especially foreigners who take interest in this museum. An issue that was previously highlighted in my literature in the case study ‘Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modelling approach with the Preliminary Application to Karachi’ by Malik, Crook and Root who mention in their study that the reason economical progress struggles in Karachi is due to environmental, social constraints. Even if people want to visit the State Bank Museum, they wont be able to do so.

For a better primary reading, I took a survey of the museums, and the maintenance, the educational history, the archiving is truly commendable but the location of this museum can act as a major detriment; Karachi’s main business hub, I.I. Chandigarh road. However, this museum can be compared to all international standards. It’s a pity for those who haven’t experienced it. Another cherry on top is the Sadeqain Gallery
where most of the lifetime achievements of this great artist have been documented and preserved. An artist who gained recognition internationally after creating art works with the social-political limitations from Zia’s era. Moving on towards the right in that same gallery space, there is a contemporary art gallery where our very own pioneer artist, Zahoor ul Aklaaq dedicates one wall to paintings. And the adjacent walls are to promote those contemporary artists who are not given opportunities in other galleries. The space of the gallery and the choice of artists can be criticized but promotion of these craft artists is something to be appreciated.

On another occasion, Ms Ibrahim states: ‘The interest in art is increasing with time thus resulting in increase of scope for this field, a lot of my friends are now buying paintings, as a form of interest and an investment and apart from that art is what makes us a cultured and civilised society’. Note how she uses the word ‘investment’ for which art is used, which makes it an important aspect for my research, thus pointing out the importance of creative economy. This can be well related to my literature article ‘Economy: The art of finance- Harold James 2008’ that speaks about the monetary value of art pieces that tends to attract collectors, Ibrahim mentions how her friends are buying art as a part of investment so does this article states the nature. ‘In order to be sure of the reliability of this function, the purchaser must be convinced of the long-term valuation of the object of desire’. If people are investing in art, this encourages the fine artist to produce more work to sell, hence employment and generation of income takes place that benefits the economy.

43 Asma Ibrahim Interviewed 20th March 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]

However, her perception about craftsmen art and Fine Art was very incoherent. For her painting as a Fine Art medium is more successful than other mediums that are only liked by a specific class of people yet to some extent her belief of the cultural economy can be reinforced. With a very direct form of vocabulary it can be evaluated that her research is more focused towards history and lab research.

4.3: Economic Perspective

It is important to understand the perspectives of economists from Pakistan. Do they see art as a contributor to the GDP of the Pakistani economy? How do they view the current place of the Pakistani economy? Therefore, two economists were interviewed for this purpose.

First I interviewed Mr. Asim Bashir, who teaches economics at SZABIST a media school in Karachi and also holds the position of the Deputy Director at Sindh Board of investment. His association with the government and economy seems to be appropriate for my research. This interview was conducted over email therefore, certain limitations occurred; his response was very abrupt without any backing to his opinion. Bashir being a part of the bigger economic picture failed to provide a rational view of the relationship between the arts and economy according to his methodology. He was unable to provide a percentage, which substantiates his claim that the creative economy is not able to flourish in Pakistan due to government’s ignorance, which is an opinion that is quite similar to that of art entrepreneurs. To quote his words, ‘Creative economy is at the stage of infancy in Pakistan.’

This is due to few job opportunities, along with lack of proper marketing along with little promotion of this field. Nevertheless, he does believe in spreading its awareness via introducing

---

45 Asim Bashir Interviewed 30th May 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]
creative economy as a separate discipline in universities and that the government needs to intervene and promote both the Pakistani culture along with tourism. This coincides with the literature ‘Arts and Economic Prosperity III’, the *Arts Mean Business* where Lynch speaks about the primary and the secondary benefits of art. In fact, Lynch specifically mentioned the role of art promoting tourism in different countries; something, which Bashir also put forth.

To get a wider opinion, Tayaba Batool, another economist was also made part of the sample. Batool works as a researcher at the Ministry of Commerce in Islamabad. The interview was conducted via email and the same questions were asked about her stance on art and its contribution to economy. Her interview was able to support the claims that were put forth in Currid’s and Florida’s theories. Batool underlines: ‘the economy works on the demand and supply rules the increase in demand will improve supply and sometimes-surplus supply can create demand. Art brings innovation and hence improves the standards of a society by creating new demands e.g. every one wants to be unique in today's world.’ Therefore, this claim is substantiated by Florida’s theory, which puts forth the idea of creativity and innovation being the key factors. The need for innovation arises when there is a demand for something unique, which is what Batool establishes in her interview. Since the interview was conducted over email, Batool was unable to answer each and every question but instead provided a quite generalized argument. Furthermore, another problem arose when her response centered around different parts of the world, and not Pakistan, which would have been more relevant. However, this perhaps reflects that people do not even realize that creative economy is taking

---

46 Tayaba Batool Interviewed 6th June 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]
its roots in this part of the world, and that there is great potential. The lack of examples from Pakistan illustrates the neglect of this important field.

Nevertheless, her interview was able to provide some excellent insight; a different viewpoint, which can be a matter of further investigation eventually. In some parts of the world, which are not inherently capitalist, markets are defined by traditions, history and values, in her opinion. In such areas, markets cannot actually survive without the presence of art. In her words ‘art in any form expresses the beliefs and traditions of that society, which enhance the level of satisfaction of the consumers ensuring prosperous economic growth. e.g. a consumer will prefer buying a shirt with his country's flag on it rather than other country's flag.’

In relation to Curid’s theory, this seems quite plausible because the popular culture is able to establish the demand for a particular commodity, which is the case in such societies. Another evidence to this claim can be found in Batool’s interview when she states the example of ‘Thailand, which has become the biggest industry for producing Buddha statues and they make it out of all things from plastics to timber and glass.’ Therefore, the cultural preferences of a particular society also shapes the scene of the economy and those cultural preferences are reflected through numerous art pieces. Hence, one can see an intimate relationship between art and economy.

While Batool and Bashir were able to provide an insight into the views of the economists, there were some limitations since they were not able to make the

---

47 Tayaba Batool Interviewed 6th June 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]

48 Tayaba Batool Interviewed 6th June 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]
distinction between fine arts and arts. However, they were able to explain how economy and art in general can have a relationship.

Therefore, it can be established through these interviews that where art has a lot of importance in the contemporary world, it does not lag behind as a field or profession. The interviews proved that there are numerous primary and secondary economic gains from art; a profession which was never thought to have a great monetary value. It is able to create employment and thus promote growth and investment. Apart from this traditional relationship between economy and art, art is also able to influence the demand and supply of the production of certain goods. In the Pakistani scene, there is an almost unanimous agreement amongst art entrepreneurs, artists and economists that art and its role in economy is still in its developing stage and needs promotion and support, both from the public and the private sector. If proper growth is to be achieved from this sector, awareness of art needs to be created on a macro level, which would lead to the creation of more jobs and thus more collaboration amongst people from different fields.
Chapter 5: CONCLUSION

The aim of this research was to discover a platform where art and economy come together. Art can have an impact on the economy and the economy can also have an effect on the art, suggesting a two-way relationship. Market gave birth to the idea of production and with that, execution and distribution as well as economics started to branch out. But the main question remains is Fine Arts really contributing to the economy?

As these people have argued that art does bring something back to the economy and that co relates with the text I put in the literature review which on the broader scale shows that the entire creative industries are valuable and that Fine Art is part of the super creative core. However, when it comes to Pakistan, there is no doubt that the art market exists, there are galleries and artists are gaining in number, but it also needs to be questioned as to whether art is part of the bigger picture in Pakistan. From my analysis and discussion I came to the conclusion that Fine Art is a part of the economy, but on a very small level, but it does serve greater purposes then just contributing to the economy.

Another problem that came across during the process of research was that there was very less interest taken by the public sector for the arts unless, we desperately need a sector which solely works for the development of Fine Arts within Pakistan. There have been measures that have been taken by the state such as funding of art festivals and events, but there is a seriously lack in funding for creation of these art works. The security required by any field is severely missing. There is a desperate need for primary promotion and recognition.

The need for promotional creativity and awareness for the arts is what brought this document to life. The quest was to find reasons in leading the current art forces in
formulizing economic strategies. Many methods were adopted to detect such strategies but only a few could be discovered. Reason was that in general, all art entrepreneurs, work with a specific school of thought but at the end its all about, encouraging art and artists. Especially art is on such a level ‘infancy’ awareness for the arts is much more important, for it to become a part of the bigger picture in the longer run.

This idea would benefit the artists but also boost up the economic infrastructure of the country as well as make it easier for artists to spend more time with their work rather than getting involved in the promotional aspect of their field. Moreover, this will bridge the gap between international and Pakistani art market. It is highly essential to go global in the long run.

In my opinion, events like Art Fest should happen annually, where artist get an opportunity to display their artworks on a much bigger level year. This will not only encourage Fine Artist but it will also bring a systematic change to the Pakistani art network but also give room to branch out to other organizations for collaborative work. Moreover, the birth of an art agency will bring a sustainable change to the current infrastructure of the art market. It will help in gaining more contacts; bring artists, buyers, collectors and corporate companies closer and facilitate in bridging the gap between parties who make, sell, buy, and fund artwork. Therefore, art as a field can be wholly developed and promoted.
APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Interview with Sameera Raja

November 10, 2013, at 05:16 PM

Interview was conducted in person, and was recorded and transcribed.

[Key: S=Shaheen SJ= Sameera Raja]

S: I’m doing my research on to what extent Art is contributing to the economy in Pakistan? Please comment on that.

SR: Well it does, it gives employment to all those artists, right, number one. Its paying for them, its paying for their lifestyle, so it does contribute towards the economy. Plus people who are investing within the country, they’re putting their money into something that is available here. So it pays for the artist, pays for the frame, pays for the gallery, so there’s an entire cycle of production taking place.

S: Who do you think mostly benefit from art in the economy?

SR: Artist. It depends who they involve, who the artist is. For example people like Adeela Suleman or Amin Gulgee, Abdul Jabbar Gul, sculptors will definitely be hiring apprentices. A lot of them will definitely have studio hands or apprentices working with them.

So they’re also putting that into the system. And it also varies case to case. So I can’t really say whose doing better economically. Naturally the people Abdul Jabbar Gul will hire will be very different from who Adeela will hire. Because its all very medium relative, right. So accordingly those kinds of people/professionals will also be getting the job. So if we think about it that the framer is involved, then of course art material suppliers are also involved. So people who frame it the wood work gy, then the canvas supplier, the paint supplier, the brush supplier, everything. There are so many other factors, photographers will also benefit because art works will be
photographed, the catalogues will be printed so the printing wala will also benefit so there are so many other people that will benefit, the hardware, the string people, if you think about it so many people are involved and benefitting from this.

S: So it’s a very expansive cycle of production?

SR: yeah it is!

S: There’s not much form of documentation when it comes to art in Pakistan, if we check online, the leading cities, the government benefits 7:1 ratio from the art market, if the government and the private sector invest 1 percent, so they get a return of 7 percent. So do you have any form of statistics with you regarding art in Pakistan? Of the input and the output.

SR: No.

S: How would you say the art market differs from the west?

SR: It’s a new market; it’s a virgin market. It’s something very new. So first what we are concentrating more is on awareness building. It’s not a market that is already developed. This is a new market. The potentials are a lot more but the drawbacks are a lot more, because to educate them is completely different from what it would be if they knew what art was, right. It’s not even about being aware, first it has to be basic art awareness education and appreciation and then going on from there to what contemporary conceptual art is.

S: okay. So in your opinion what role does our government play in this, the public funding and promoting the arts?

SR: The government already has enough issues on their hands to worry about art. It’s the least of their priorities. The government who doesn’t provide security to its citizens, I don’t think this is a priority, the private sector has to intervene, philanthropist, multinationals, financial institutions all of them have to intervene.
S: In what other ways can art be more involved that further benefits the country? For example Pursukoon Karachi happened where the artists took an initiative to restore the Cantt Station, and peace in the city so what is your stance on its other benefits?

SR: Awareness building, appreciation of the arts. Getting them to see something that they wont see ordinarily. Participation, and interactive art can also take place if its happening in a public space, where people can see it as public art and know what’s happening. Its not just Pursukoon, even in Amin Gulgees sculptors on the round about where people can see it, Naiza Khan did her henna women on the boundary walls of places 10,12 years back if Im not mistaken near Cantt Station. So that was also awareness building right, Asim Butt did his graffiti during the time where all these strikes were happening, the ‘stop and say no’. All of that just makes you stop and think. I think the most important thing art can do is it gets you somewhere whether its emotionally or physically or spiritually or however it is. But when an artist is doing something, even in a gallery space. It engages the viewer. That viewership is what you enforce. It’s not just about the economics of it. Plenty of people walking into a gallery space are not all buyers, its about awareness and appreciation. So that can be added on I think, it’s the biggest thing art can do; engaging people, create a dialogue, engaging in any way whether its is just by opening a dialogue or just making somebody think or lead somebody with an impression that they feel about it whether its good or bad, it makes them intellectually think or whatever. That angle I think is the foremost than any other economic activity.

S: What sort of role the art collectors play in this activity-taking place?

SR: We don’t have collectors in Pakistan, be very clear about that, we have buyers. Anyone who buys art is a buyer but collectors are people who follow the career of the artist, it’s a very serious thing. We have people who like something and they buy it.
It’s same like we use the word like we use gallery very loosely. People who don’t know the meaning and use it in that context, ‘oh this is a gallery’, ‘oh this is the curator or collector’, we have people who buy art.

S: Thank you so much for your time, it was great talking to you.

SR: You’re welcome.
Appendix 2: Interview with Sameera Raja

March 20, 2014, at 02:00PM

Interview was conducted again in person after the success of Sindh Art Fest, and was recorded and transcribed.

[Key: S=Shaheen SJ= Sameera Raja]

S: So previously we discussed about to what extent is art contributing to economy and you spoke about awareness building and you had a very negative stance about our government and how they function, but what happened after that was the Sindh Art festival where you were the in charge for the Art Fest, What’s your opinion and how much was the government actually involved or was it just a part of making an event happen?

SR: As far as the Art Festival is concerned, the Sindh Festival must have been on their agenda for sometime, well I was just asked literally in the middle of December, just 6 weeks before the event. The event was in February, so in these 6 weeks I was contacted and they wanted me to do it and my immediate response was ‘I don’t want anything to do with the government, but they were very inclined, ‘You’re the premier gallery of Karachi and we want to put the best foot forward’, so by that token I can say at least they did their research. They didn’t just go to anyone; they said everyone’s recommended you, which mean they must’ve spoken to people. They said we want you to do what you do in you gallery, so I said you do realise it’s not going to be a ‘saqafti’ mela. If you’re calling me then it’s not going to be what the government generally puts up. There’s going to be a huge difference. I said you do realise and they said they do and its fine, ‘we’re giving you that project, so you do it as you think. It makes me think they must’ve done their research, they must’ve found out its art related or whatever, so that they can give that much freedom to somebody
to work within that boundaries. And the best thing they could’ve done was give us that freedom, so there was nothing they told me you can’t do this or put this up. They provided me the infrastructure, so if I said I wanted Frere Hall, they worked on it and made sure it was available. So the logistics came from them, whether it was the space, whether it was the security, all the security was provided by them, there was art work in a public space and it was the first time that in a public space for an extended period the work was on display; 2 weeks. Frere Hall is not closed, its very open, even the boundary walls do not exist its just the chandni, so anybody can come in, the gardens are constantly open 24 hours. We had art works within the gardens, the parks so that was a huge endeavour that they actually planned it such that nothing happened. They were very responsible. Yes they provided us the logistics I can’t complain about that, they provided us with security; all levels of police were involved, whether it was the special security unit, the traffic police or the thannay walas. They were all involved, either special security for Bilawal Bhutto or Sherry Rehman, however it was I don’t know and I don’t care, all I know is that it was done, so when I said we wanted 24 hours police manning the space, I was provided with that. Because if we’re leaving something, outside, anyone can either steal or vandalise it. So inside and outside they had this entire regiment and it was wow. Very organised, with a portal to walk through so I must appreciate that and Frere Hall management was very good, everybody was cooperative. Its not they did anything but at least they didn’t undo and that really worked.

**S:** At least it was a first from their part.

**SR:** It was and I will only take it that great at least there is public sector involvement and the only reason I went forward was that I don’t take that they go somewhere stupid, like a paint shop and put up something terrible that generally Frere Hall puts
up. I will never have ta neck to stand on when we people say we don’t have any public art, I will never be able to say that. So though it was a very short time period generally these things take about a year in advance but in those 6 weeks I got Vasl involved, which means Adeela and myself ended up doing the whole show. So it was very stressful and it was a lot of work but I think that it was the best thing given the fact that public sector came to you and asked you to do something.

S: What about the works that were displayed at the Art Fest? some of them had been displayed before, what about commissioned art works?

SR: All the Site- Specific artworks were specifically made for that show, which were commissioned, the rest were old art works of contemporary art most of the artists provided with work that they already had others produced for the purpose of this display and others were from Benazir’s collection.

S: What is your stance on Pursukoon Karachi and Art Fest? How were they different?

SR: Pusukoon Karachi was an initiative of the Koel Gallery and they went to the Sindh Government and said that we’re doing this event to so we need support. The organisers had been working on this event for the past one year, so there were a lot of meetings and different groups were made working on different projects at the same time. And the main group went to the government for support. Ours was very different, I didn’t go to anyone the government contacted me and said that we’re doing this and we want the art festival to be a part of Sindh Festival and we just had 6 weeks to put up this show. They chose me.

S: On what basis did you short-list those artists who displayed art works at the Art Fest?

SR: The condition that the government did put was the artists have to be from Sindh, we agreed but we said artist who has any form of association with Sindh should
display or they’re living and working in Sindh. For example like mainstream artist like Ayaz Jokhio, who’s from Sindh but now lives in Lahore, R.M Naeem or Sajjad who’s from Lahore but now works in Karachi. Artists like these who fit the criteria were selected. But the larger part has to be from Sindh. And obviously the mainstream artist since the modern artist display was already there from Benazir’s personal collection.

S: How was the turn out of this event?

SR: It was fabulous! I’m so impressed, about 7000-8000 people attended this event In 2 weeks, which is unbelievable, especially cities like Karachi. And this is again with minimum intervention so it’s not like we prepared for a year, just 6 weeks!! It was right there. Oh my god we faced so many issues, time issues, handling 65 artists, the commissioned artists, the government, the Frere Hall management, the park management their different, all levels of police, after all this we had to get the renovation done, fix the infrastructure, hire an architect to get a structure made so that it does not effect the heritage site. All done in those 6 weeks.

The only time something works when it’s a public/private partnership. Private people they work and the public is the one with the funds and space. So this collaboration was a major success.

S: Thank you so much for your time, this information is very helpful for my research.

SR: You’re welcome; let me know if you need more help regarding your research.
Appendix 3: Interview with Asma Ibrahim

20th March 2014, at 04:30PM

Interview was conducted again in person recorded and transcribed.

[Key: S=Shaheen AI= Asma Ibrahim]

S: How often do you have Visitors at The State Bank Museum?

AI: We usually have students, coming in on a daily basis, and foreigners take a lot of interest in this museum but for the time being, we don’t have visitors due to threats.

S: How does the public respond to this museum?

AI: Amazing, for them it’s an amazing experience to have a museum here up to the international level.

S: Why did you leave the National Museum of Pakistan? How often did you have Exhibitions over there?

AI: The national museum was not functioning well, less people were coming in due to its location and apart from the permanent display, we used to have an art piece of the month, The Japanese came in and set up an entire room, which attracted a lot of people, but not anymore.

S: What are the interests of the public towards art generally?

AI: It’s a lot. The interest in art is increasing with time thus resulting in increase of scope for this field, a lot of my friends are now buying paintings, as a form of interest and an investment and apart from that art is what makes us a cultured and civilised society.

S: Do you think art is contributing to the economy in Pakistan? In what ways?

AI: Now it is. Its giving employment to all the artist and craftsmen we have here.

S: How do you think art can be more involved in the economy of Pakistan?

AI: We need to open more employment opportunities for artist.
S: Thank you so much for your time.

AI: You’re welcome.
Appendix 4: Interview with NoorJehan Bilgrami

31<sup>th</sup> May 2014, at 03:30PM

Interview was conducted again in person recorded and transcribed.

[Key: S=Shaheen NB= NoorJehan Bilgrami]

S: How long have you been associated with art?

NB: I studied art, I learned painting, this is when we had the arts council, National College of Arts way before Indus Valley School of Art and Architecture came into being.

S: How did the idea of Koel come into being?

NB: Koel came much much much later. I was more associated with the restoring and revival of Block prints. Koel was nothing back then. Well partly to do with Fine Arts and looking at textiles from an artist’s point of view. I was painting and then I realised I’ll explore the process of block printing.

S: How long has it been for Koel gallery to come into being?

NB: Koel is very old, it’s been in business for the past 30 years, but the gallery is very new, it’s been here for the past 5 years. First the textile display, then the gallery and then the café was opened.

S: So do you think after the café was opened more people started taking interest in the gallery?

NB: People come to the gallery regardless, not because of the café but there’s a different lot who comes to the café, but they do come because they’re here, they’re curious of what’s happening, so it works as awareness building as well and because of the textile shop additional lot comes in, bringing variety of people together where we offer a different variety because its something they probably don’t know, they’re not used to going to art galleries. It invites different kinds of people.
S: What was the response initially? And how is it now?

NB: The gallery when it opened, we started really small with just ideas, with our very dear good friends, one being late Usman Ghauri, he was very keen to establish this gallery. We had this space here where I used to display my textiles before. But also I had a gallery long time back, before Indus Valley was founded. In front of my house was a small space. It was called ‘Maharat’ but then immediately after opening the gallery we founded Indus Valley where 8 years of my time day and night went straight in forming the school so the gallery was neglected.

When I had space here so I thought why not open one here? It was something of interest to me and then we formed a gallery committee, which is different since nobody else had, with Habib Fidah ali, Arshad Faruqi, Amean J, Usman Ghauri so we thought how we can make it different. Because of my own involvement in crafts, I wanted to create a platform for craftsman who’re excelling. So we bought in the former concept of Maharat gallery that anyone who is a ‘mahir’ (expert) we can display their work.

S: So its not just Fine Art but it was in collaboration with craftsmen?

NB: I wanted to encourage artist to work with the craftsman and come up with different creations. So Arshad’s last metal exhibition for example was also a take on that.

S: So what about exhibitions? Initially how many exhibitions did Koel gallery host and what’s the current scenario?

NB: I was recently checking the biography of 2009 and previously we used to host an exhibition every 15 days, but now there’s a show in every 10 days. Which is what
canvas and other places do. Many ventures are taking place so the awareness is also
taking place.

S: Is it easy to shortlist artist for shows?

NB: Depends on what kind of work you’re looking at, there is no such thing as bad
art as you know but because when you work with a team, it’s not just a very
subjective view, but your looking at other peoples opinion as well.

S: About Fine Art contributing to our economy specifically, what would you like to
comment on that?

NB: For galleries like canvas and VM art gallery can give a better feedback but of
course it is, its generating work which is the naturally generating income and reaching
out. It is slightly different from other fields. It is not a factory that is affecting to many
people but it affects individuals inter based. Its on a smaller thing, but touching to that
level of society and culture which is extremely important for the nation. Apart from
that artists have done brilliantly abroad as you’re aware of it. Just the fact that they’re
taking a fantastic image of Pakistan, so this branching out of art brings back more
benefits.

S: What other way do you think Fine Art can contribute economically, get more
involved?

NB: I do feel that it elevates your sense of aesthetics. Problem solving Artist reach
out beyond just creating an image. There are so many different ways one can improve
the quality of work. For instance the work happening at the Cantt station in relation to
Pursukoon Karachi. It was all to be raising awareness and its all connected too the
artist. Times are changing so theres need to be more and more interaction between
artist and architects and designers, that what I do, bridging gaps.

S: So what about Pursukoon Karachi? How was your experience?
NB: Due to the sad state of our country and the situation of the city many people couldn’t show up though the response was great. The experience was very exhilarating beyond my expectations it just put us up and above, with everybody asking us if this is going to be an annual feature? Which that I don’t know because it’s such a small group working on this. And ive got this mammoth down at the Cantt station that I’d like to complete, which is going to take a year. But we don’t have to feel bound to make this happen every year, it will take its own form where artists should come up with their own ideas as to how these ventures can move forward.

S: What about the government support for Pursukoon Karachi?

NB: Government did give us support we won’t have been able to do it without their help. All the money came form the government, but we were not making money which was a good thing that artists were pushed in working with limitations, they should know that this is their economy this is their country, so give it your best. We do need a lot of funds to go ahead with such projects like the one I’m currently working on at Cantt Station. More help, more ideas, more volunteers are required to make such events possible. I want this to take on its own form like Indus Valley did, I’m not sitting there now but it’s functioning well

S: Do you intend to have more ventures like these after the Cantt station project?

NB: Id like to be more organic if it has to happen it would happen. But even small little interventions are important in Pakistan and if it brings something large then good, if not one must continue to do small things.

Culturally art has a lot of potential. There has to be more and more involvement by the artist in the real world, its important for social interventions. That is why Pursukoon was an important step. It bought everyone together working for the same cause.
S: Thank you so much for your time it was great talking to you.

NB: You’re welcome!
Appendix 5: Interview with Asim Bashir Khan

May 30\textsuperscript{th} 2014

Interview was conducted via email.

<shaheen.jaffrani@gmail.com>

<abkhanlodhi@yahoo.com>

[Key: S=Shaheen AB= Asim Bashir]

\textbf{S:} From your economic perspective, what is your opinion on Art and its involvement in contributing to the economy? Please comment on that.

\textbf{AS:} I think it’s difficult to compute or give some percentage for the contribution the methodology, which usually economists follow.

\textbf{S:} Over the years how has the creative economy evolved in Pakistan? What is its role?

\textbf{AS:} Creative economy is at the stage of infancy in Pakistan.

\textbf{S:} Is there an increase or decrease in interest? Job opportunities for graduates?

\textbf{AS:} Less job opportunities due to no formal market for creative economy.

\textbf{S:} If the scenario had changed or not so how? How do we encourage the creative economy here?

\textbf{AS:} We need to introduce this as discipline in Universities.

\textbf{S:} How do you feel about the cultural economy of Pakistan? What kind of involvement does it have?

\textbf{AS:} Cultural Economy has not been promoted in Pakistan yet and the Government is not serious to market our culture and tourism.
Appendix 6: Interview with Tayaba Batool.

June 6th 2014.

Interview was conducted via email and a collective response was received

[Key: S= Shaheen  TB= Tayaba Batool]

<shaheen.jaffrani@gmail.com>
<tayaba.batool@fulbrightmail.org>

S: My research question is 'Art for the few? Art for all? How art contributes to the Economy of Pakistan?'

- From your economic perspective, what is your opinion on Art and its involvement in contributing to the economy? Please comment on that.
- Over the years how has the creative economy evolved in Pakistan? What is its role?
  Is there an increase or decrease in interest?
  Job opportunities for graduates?
  If the scenario had changed or not so how?
  How do we encourage the creative economy here?
- How do you feel about the cultural economy of Pakistan? What kind of involvement does it have?
- I’m particularly focusing on Fine Art so kindly comment its place within the cultural economy.

TB: I can’t answer question by question due to paucity of time, however narrative answer is as follows:

Since ancient history Art has always been an important part of the economies. Starting from the barter systems to the paper money age, people either want to barter mirrors for grains or wanted to make their paper money beautiful by art works
including pictures, geometrical designs, calligraphy etc. even in the coin age, the carvings on the coins is but a form of art.

The question that how does it contributes to the economy? Is very simple. The economy works on the demand and supply rules the increase in demand will improve supply and sometimes surplus supply can create demand. Art brings innovation and hence improves the standards of a society by creating new demands. E.g., every one wants to be unique in today's world. The more beautiful dress being produced by a brand, the more it will be in demand and thus lead to economic growth especially if it go beyond borders. On the other hand marketing is a reality now days. It affects the demand created by supply of goods. The more innovative marketing of a good will improve its demand and the consumer will purchase it. Also it created inspiration for earning better thus may increase the income of a common man. Also creating more jobs etc.

As far as cultural economy is concerned, it is again based on preferences. Markets become cultures and vice versa. in my opinion, countries where the markets define cultures (more of capitalist economies), the art may not find their way as art has its origins embedded in traditions, values, history etc. However areas where history and traditions are of prime importance, the markets cannot survive without art due to the reason that art in any form expresses the beliefs and traditions of that society, which enhance the level of satisfaction of the consumers ensuring prosperous economic growth. E.g. a consumer will prefer buying a shirt with his country's flag on it rather than other country's flag. Similarly some might prefer to buy an American flag shirt than his own. it depends on the cultural preferences.

Art on the other hand will mould the products according to the needs of the cultural priorities be it religious or morality based. For example in some countries people
would prefer innovative art works depicting their cultural believes- Thailand has become the biggest industry for producing Buddha statues and they make it out of all things, from plastics to timber and glass others want abstract art works. This phenomenon has dispersed over all the sectors. The Architecture, for that matter depicts the behaviour of the nation. Many nations -e.g. Germany and Poland etc.- have evolved their architecture from more carved art forms to simple and geometrical modern day arts. this has defined the markets and their preferences as well. The production of goods from utensils to houses has also responded to it.

The question is if this evolution plays any role in economic growth? It does a lot. Taking the bigger picture the art is the key to innovation either evolved or traditional. The art of every area is unique thus giving an absolute or comparative advantage to a country over the other. That makes each country / market interacts with another country/market leading to exchange and economic growth on a bigger scenario. Since art is innovative it keeps the market changing its preferences and thus a need/demand for something new prevails which improves economic activity.

In the end people will prefer buying a piece of art, which corresponds to their aesthetics and aesthetics, comes through art.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Asma Ibrahim Interviewed 20th March 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]

Asim Bashir Interviewed 30th May 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]

Author Unknown,’ How the Arts Contribute to the Economy’, Support the Arts,

(Posted: Unknown)

Author Unknown,’ How the Arts Contribute to the Economy’, Support the Arts,

(Posted: Unknown)

Ammar A. Malik, Andrew T. Crooks, Hilton L. Root. ‘Can Pakistan have creative cities? An agent based modelling approach with preliminary application to Karachi’, Pakistan strategy Support program, 2013 (case study)

Dar Khua, ‘ Renewing Passports’, Art Now (Posted: Unknown)


[Last accessed: 7th June 2014]


Harold James, Economy: The art of finance, Daily Times,(posted: 8th October 2008)

http://supportthearts.co.uk/economy [Last Accessed: 4th November 2013]

http://supportthearts.co.uk/economy [Last Accessed: 7th November 2013]

http://supportthearts.co.uk/economy [Last Accessed: 7th November 2013]

http://www.artnowpakistan.com/Profile/CanvassingforArtSameeraRaja-114.html#.Uoq9EDlps6g [last accessed: 9th November 2013]


Mahim Maher. ‘The day the music died - why Karachi lost its groove during Zia ul Haq’s regime’, The Express Tribune, (Posted: 3rd November 2013)


NoorJehan Bilgrami Interviewed 31st May 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]


Sameera Raja Interviewed 10th November 2013. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]

Sameera Raja Interviewed 20th March 2014. [Interview was conducted in person and transcribed]

Tayaba Batool Interviewed 6th June 2014. [Interview was conducted via email]

Unknown Author. ‘Canvassing for Art: Sameera Raja’, Art Now. [posted:unknown]